



Effect of Nursery Age (Stunting) and Density on Polyculture Performance of Mullet Species; *Mugil Capito* and *Mugil Cephalus*

Waleed N. El-Hawarry

Department of Animal Husbandry and Animal Wealth Development, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Alexandria University. Egypt.

Key words:

Nursery age (stunting),
Stocking density,
Polyculture, *Mugil capito*,
Mugil cephalus.

*Correspondence to:

waleed.elhawarry@alexu.edu.eg

ABSTRACT

Eight earthen ponds (4-5 feddan pond⁻¹) were used for polyculture of *Mugil capito* and *Mugil cephalus*. Each pond was assigned a rearing density and a nursery age for both *M. capito* and *M. cephalus*. For each species of mullet, a 2 x 2 factorial design was assembled with two age groups (A1, A2) and two stocking densities (low stocking density; LSD and high stocking density; HSD) in an experiment extended for 214-days. Juvenile *M. capito* (A1; 16 months and 3.32 ± 0.37: 4.23±0.37g) and *M. cephalus* (A1; 8 months and 6.86±0.55: 8.22±0.55 g) were distributed into two earthen ponds (pond no 1 and 2) and stocked at two densities; *M. capito* (Low stocking density “LSD”, 1200 fish feddan⁻¹ and high stocking density “HSD” 2000 fish feddan⁻¹) whereas *M. cephalus* were stocked at rates of 500 fish feddan⁻¹ (LSD) and 1000 fish feddan⁻¹ (HSD). The second age group fish (A2) of each species; *M. capito* (A2; 28 months and 7.28±0.37: 7.61±0.37 g) and *M. cephalus* (A2; 20 months and 12.8±0.55: 13.29±0.55 g) were also distributed in another two ponds (pond no 3 and 4) with the same density trend applied for the first age group fish where each treatment was duplicated. The obtained results notify the significant effect (P < 0.05) of both nursery age (stunting) culture density in the growth of both species with regard to the FBW, TBG and SGR %. The highest FBW, TBG and SGR (%) was attained by *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* having longer nursery age (stunting) and cultured at LSD. Whereas the NFY and TFY increased as the culture density did. Additionally and irrespective of culture density the RTFY impressively improved (P < 0.05) as the nursery age (stunting) increased. This study clarified that increasing space and food availability as compared to what is happening in the nursery ponds together with the nursery age (stunting) had synergistic effects in the subsequent culture period. Also, increasing the nursery duration (stunting) had relieved the density effect for both species when compared to their younger mates maintained at LSD. It can be concluded that stunted mullet species showed compensatory growth in both stunted groups. Also, the availability of good-quality fry or juveniles together with the nursery age (stunting period), stocking density, as well as the market size preferability, would be of concern in polyculture of *M. capito* and *M. cephalus*.

1. INTRODUCTION

Fish harvests from aquaculture surpassed one million tonnes per year positioning Egyptian aquaculture eighth among the preeminent fish producers on the planet (FAO, 2016). Tilapia is the foremost species; it accounts for more than half of all fish produced through aquaculture. Tilapia is followed in importance by mullets and together these two species contributed 85.1 % of total aquaculture production (El-Sayed, 2017). Since polyculture improves the utilization of accessible

assets to deliver benefits associated with advanced ecological stability and increases producer profitability (McKinnon et al., 2002). Nile tilapia, mullet and carp polyculture principally practiced in freshwater and brackish earthen ponds (El-Sayed, 2007). The cultured species are different in their ecological requirements and feeding behaviors thus they effectively utilize the natural food available in the pond (Zimmermann and New 2000). Tilapia and Mullet are mainly practiced by private farms as

tilapia-mullet polyculture rather than tilapia monoculture (Dickson 2016). Extruded feed is supplied to semi-intensive polyculture ponds to cover only the feeding requirements of both tilapias and carps grown in the same ponds; mullets profit from the remains of artificial feed for tilapias and carps (Sadek 2016).

Several mullet species are cultured of which *Mugil capito*

(Thin-lipped mullet) and *Mugil cephalus* (flathead grey mullet) have higher growth rates hence; they are the species of choice for Egyptian farmers (Saleh, 2008). The production of both species reached 119 647 Ton ranking Egypt as the world leader in mullet production (FAO. 2016).). The culture of mullet depends on fries collected from the wild (Saleh, 2008). The largest portion of mullet production is dedicated to *Liza ramada* due to its higher seed availability as compared to *M. cephalus* (Sadek and Mires, 2000).

On the other hand, it is well known that fish display stunted growth or suppression when reared under high stocking density (Pickering, 1981; Wedemeyer and McLeay, 1981; Wedemeyer, 1997) or experience diet limitations and/ or starvation for a transitory or extended period (Ali et al., 2003; Abdel-Hakim et al., 2009). Stunted individuals of many fishes exhibited an accelerated growth behavior in a phenomenon known as compensatory growth (CG) including rohu, *Labeo rohita* (Das et al., 2016), bighead carp (Santiago et al., 2004), sunfish (Hayward et al. 1997), Nile tilapia (Little et al., 2003; El-Hawarry, 2006) and African catfish, (Ali and Jauncey, 2004). This compensatory growth occurs as a response to safeguard the deviancy from the ultimate growth course during their re-alimentation period (Ali et al., 2003). Therefore, this phenomenon had dragged the attention, principally in commercial aquaculture, as it represents a way to ameliorate fish growth performance since its intensity can force some fish species to show higher growth rates than continuously fed ones. Such reports, approving and alongside the CG response in the various studied species constitute vagueness on the existence of the phenomenon.

Concerning mullet species; they grow slowly at their initial life stage (Hickling, 1970; Bishara, 1978; De Silva, 1980; Saleh, 2008) hence the direct stocking of small fry (15-25 mm) to growout ponds yield small sized fish. Therefore, initial rearing step will be a prerequisite to get fingerlings (100-120 mm) that attain higher growth rates during the culture period. Fry of *M cephalus* are kept in the

nursery ponds for four-six months (from August-November till April) until they are about 10 g in weight. Over-wintered mullet fingerlings are sold for on-growing in various culture systems, but especially in semi-intensive ponds (Saleh, 2008). When fingerlings survival and availability surpasses culture needs, they are reserved in the nurseries at high stocking densities for the next growout season.

This has likewise turned into a prominent tactic to secure a continuous supply of mullet fingerlings at culture time. Despite the fact that fish culturist trust that these stunted fingerlings attain higher growth rates in the ensuing culture stage, the idea does not have any logical premise because of few investigations. Accordingly, some fundamental inquiries come with regards to stunted mullet fingerlings: do they display CG in the following culture period? Does the CG reaction, assuming any, connect to the nursery duration or the subsequent culture density of the stunted fingerlings? Is the stunted mullet size at stocking neglected by the fish culturist hence conveying biased results?

Therefore this study aims to clarify the influence of nursery age (stunting) and stocking density on the growth performance, production parameters and the related water quality of *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* under semiintensive culture condition.

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

2.1. Experimental fish

This experiment was conducted in a private fish farm located in Edko, Bhaira Governorate, Egypt. Overwintered *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* fingerlings were obtained from four different nursery ponds belong to the farm. For each species two ages were chosen; the *M. capito* nursery ages were 16 and 28 months (i.e. stunted for 16 and 28 mos), whereas, the *M. cephalus* were 8 and 20 months (i.e. stunted for 8 and 20 mos).

2.2. Experimental design and set up

The experimental design and set up is displayed in table 1. Eight earthen ponds (4-5 feddan pond¹) were used for polyculture of *M. capito*, *M. cephalus* and tilapia. Each pond was assigned a rearing density and a nursery age for both *M. capito* and *M. cephalus*. The stocking density of Nile tilapia was fixed at 12600 fish feddan⁻¹ in all experimental ponds. For each species of mullet, a 2 x 2 factorial design was assembled with two age groups (A1, A2) and two stocking densities (LSD and HSD) in an experiment extended for 214-days.

Table (1): Experimental design

Nursery Age	Age 1				Age 2			
	Pond1	Pond2	Pond3	Pond4	Pond1	Pond2	Pond3	Pond4
Species	<i>M. capito</i> (16 mos)	<i>M. cephalus</i> (8 mos)	<i>M. capito</i> (16 mos)	<i>M. cephalus</i> (8 mos)	<i>M. capito</i> (28 mos)	<i>M. cephalus</i> (20 mos)	<i>M. capito</i> (28 mos)	<i>M. cephalus</i> (20 mos)
Stoking density (fish feddan ⁻¹)	1200	500	2000	1000	1200	500	2000	1000

Juvenile *M. capito* (A1; 16 months and 3.32 ± 0.37 : 4.23 ± 0.37 g) and *M. cephalus* (A1; 8 months and 6.86 ± 0.55 : 8.22 ± 0.55 g) were distributed into two earthen ponds (pond no 1 and 2) and stocked at two densities; juvenile *M. capito* were stocked at rates of 1200 fish feddan⁻¹ (LSD) and 2000 feddan⁻¹ (HSD) whereas *M. cephalus* were stocked at rates of 500 feddan⁻¹ (LSD) and 1000 feddan⁻¹ (HSD). The second age group fish (A2) of each species; *M. capito* (A2; 28 months and 7.28 ± 0.37 : 7.61 ± 0.37 g) and *M. cephalus* (A2; 20 months and 12.8 ± 0.55 : 13.29 ± 0.55 g) were also distributed in another two ponds (pond no 3 and 4) with the same density trend applied for the first age group fish where each treatment was duplicated.

2.3. Pond preparation and management

Pre-stocking dryness of all ponds was carried out for 4 weeks. Thereafter initial fertilization was carried out using poultry manure at the rate of 500 kg feddan⁻¹ (Green et al., 2002). Then water was allowed to fill the ponds to maintain a water column of 30 cm for 7-10 ds. Thereafter the different fish species were distributed in each pond as assigned in the experimental design. The water level was then elevated to 1.5–1.75 m within a week. To keep high natural pond productivity, poultry manure was applied daily to attain nitrogen, phosphorus inputs, of 28 kg N ha⁻¹ week⁻¹ and 7 N ha⁻¹ week⁻¹ (Lin et al., 1997). Supplemental feeding was adjusted biweekly and provided to meet the daily feed requirements of tilapias grown in the same ponds whereas the tested species (*M. capito* and *M. cephalus*) profit from the uneaten feed provided to tilapia (Sadek 2015).

2.4. Water quality sampling and analysis procedure

For each pond assigned in this study, water samples were gathered from five places (Boyd and Tucker 1992). The collected water samples from each pond were pooled together to obtain a one litter sample pond⁻¹. The dissolved oxygen (Oxyguard handy III, Oxyguard International, Birkerod, Denmark, DO; mg l⁻¹) and pH (Wide range pH paper; 1-14, Whatman, UK) of each sample were measured in

the farm. The homogenously pooled samples were then taken to the laboratory to measure the total ammonia nitrogen (TAN; mg l⁻¹), organic matter (mg l⁻¹) and total hardness (mg l⁻¹) (HACH Company analytical kits, Loveland, CO 80539 USA). Also, the water temperature was determined daily (°C) while the water transparency (cm) of each pond was measured biweekly (12:00-13.00 hours) (Boyd and Tucker 1992). Also, the total phytoplankton (cells ml⁻¹) and zooplankton (animals l⁻¹) were estimated following the methods described in APHA (2012).

2.5. Growth measurements

At the pre-stocking immediate time, the fingerlings of each tested species and age were counted and batch weighted during its collection from their respective nursery ponds. Biweekly samples were also weighed to monitor the growth rates. At final harvest, fishes were washed, species differentiated, size graded and batch weighed in plastic boxes (25 kg fish box⁻¹) and the total number of fish was determined for each experimental pond. The following growth variables were calculated; final body weight (FBW, g fish⁻¹), total body gain (TBG, g fish⁻¹), specific growth rate (SGR, % day⁻¹), net fish yield (NFY, kg feddan⁻¹), total fish yield (TFY, kg feddan⁻¹) and relative total fish yield, were calculated. The survival rate was also calculated.

2.6. Statistical analysis

The growth and yield attributes in terms of cumulative weights and growth variables (i.e., FBW, TBG, SGR %, NFY and TFY) of *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* of different nursery (stunting) age polycultured under different stocking densities were calculated and analyzed.

2.6.1. Total body gain (TBG g fish⁻¹)

TBG= Mean final weight – Mean initial weight.

2.6.2. Specific growth rate (SGR, % day⁻¹):

$$\text{SGR \%} = \frac{\text{Ln } W_1 - \text{Ln } W_0}{T} \times 100$$

Where W_1 = final mean fish weight (g), W_0 = initial mean fish weight (g), t = time in days and Ln = natural log.

2.6.3. Total fish yield (TFY, kg feddan⁻¹)

TFY = Mean final weight \times number of fish at harvest.

2.6.4. Net fish yield (NFY, kg feddan⁻¹)

NFY= Total harvest weights - initial weight of stocked fish.

2.76.5. Survival Rate (SR, %)

SR% = Final No. of fish /initial No. of fish ×100

The diverse growth factors are elements of body weight of fish (Jobling, 1994; Wootton, 1998). At the start of the experiment, there were noticeable variances in the initial weight of the tested mullet species. Consequently, the means of the initial mullet weights should be adjusted to get rid of the initial weight effect on the subsequent production variables. Hence, the appropriate analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) was performed where the initial mullet weight was taken as a covariate (Huitema, 2011). Analysis of variance was also applied to assess the effects of the treatment of on water quality criteria and total yield of both species. SAS (2004) was used for analysis of data; significant differences were deliberated at $P < 0.05$.

3. RESULTS

The growth and yield as well as the survival of both *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* polycultured together are presented in table 2. The obtained results notify the

significant effect ($P < 0.05$) of both nursery age (stunting) culture density in the growth of both species with regard to the FBW, TBG and SGR %. The highest FBW, TBG and SGR (%) was attained by *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* having longer nursery age (stunting) and cultured at LSD. Whereas the NFY and TFY increased as the culture density did. Additionally and irrespective of culture density the RTFY impressively improved ($P < 0.05$) as the nursery age (stunting) increased (Figure 1). Likewise, there was a significant difference ($P < 0.05$) in the survival rate among different mullet groups. However, it should be noted that survival rate was generally high. No mortalities observed among mullet species throughout the culture period hence these differences might be due to a count error at the start of the experiment. Regarding the water quality parameters (table 3); no significant effect ($P > 0.05$) detected among the different treatments except for the dissolved oxygen contents but still, it was within the desirable limits required by both species. Also, the zooplankton content considerably differed with the highest levels observed in the ponds stocked with young mullets (nursery age1) at LSD.

Table (2): Growth and yield attributes (LS means ± SE) of stunted *M. cephalus* and *M. capito* juveniles in subsequent polyculture grow-out phases

Species	<i>M. capito</i>				<i>M. cephalus</i>			
	16 mos		28 mos		8 mos		20 mos	
Nursery age (stunting)								
Stoking density (fish feddan ⁻¹)	1200	2000	1200	2000	500	1000	500	1000
Initial weight (g fish ⁻¹)	3.32±0.37 ^b	4.23±0.37 ^b	7.28±0.37 ^a	7.61±0.37 ^a	6.86±0.55 ^b	8.22±0.55 ^b	12.8±0.55 ^a	13.29±0.55 ^a
FBW (g fish ⁻¹)	238.28±9.42 ^b	141.02±7.72 ^c	438.01±8.21 ^a	213.19±8.83 ^b	253.28±9.42 ^b	156.02±7.72 ^c	488.01±8.21 ^a	263.19±8.83 ^b
TBG (g fish ⁻¹)	232.67±9.42 ^b	135.41±7.72 ^c	432.4±8.21 ^a	207.58±8.83 ^b	242.98±9.42 ^b	145.73±7.72 ^c	477.72±8.21 ^a	252.9±8.83 ^b
SGR (% day ⁻¹)	1.79±0.02 ^b	1.52±0.02 ^c	2.09±0.02 ^a	1.76±0.02 ^b	1.52±0.02 ^b	1.28±0.02 ^c	1.83±0.02 ^a	1.55±0.02 ^b
NFY (kg feddan ⁻¹)	241.87±15.61 ^c	235.66±12.79 ^c	479.27±13.59 ^a	421.99±14.62 ^b	111.94±7.19 ^c	138.07±5.89 ^b	233.46±6.26 ^a	245.68±6.73 ^a
TFY (kg feddan ⁻¹)	248.88±15.62 ^c	245.31±12.82 ^c	484.64±13.63 ^a	433.99±14.66 ^b	117.85±7.13 ^c	147.49±5.84 ^b	237.72±6.21 ^a	256.24±6.68 ^a
SR (%)	94.74±0.43 ^b	97.34±0.35 ^a	96.04±0.38 ^b	97.79±0.41 ^a	95.87±0.17 ^a	95.48±0.14 ^b	96.23±0.15 ^a	96.42±0.16 ^a
RTFY (%)	100	99	195	174	100	125	202	217

*For each species; means within the same raw with different superscript are significantly different (p< 0.05).

**FBW, g fish⁻¹: final body weight, TBG (g fish⁻¹): total body gain, SGR (% day⁻¹): specific growth rate, NFY (kg feddan⁻¹): net fish yield, TFY (kg feddan⁻¹): total fish yield SR (%): survival rate and RTFY (%): relative total fish yield, were calculated.

***Relative total fish yield (RTFY) is reported in relation to the yield of young nursery age at low stocking density of each species.

Table (3): Yield attributes (LS means \pm SE) of polycultured *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* as affected by nursery age (stunting) and stocking density

Treatment Parameters	Nursery Age1 (<i>M. capito</i> ; 16 mos and <i>M. cephalus</i> ; 8 mos)		Nursery Age2 (<i>M. capito</i> ; 28 mos and <i>M. cephalus</i> ; 20 mos)	
	LSD	HSD	LSD	HSD
	Total net fish yield (kg feddan ⁻¹)	389.72 \pm 16.08 ^b	395.34 \pm 16.08 ^b	686.53 \pm 16.08 ^a
Total fish yield (kg feddan ⁻¹)	393.51 \pm 15.88 ^b	403.05 \pm 15.88 ^b	694.26 \pm 15.88 ^a	651.12 \pm 15.88 ^a
Relative total fish yield (%)	100	102	176	165

* Means within the same raw with different superscripts are significantly different (P < 0.05).

**Nursery Age1, LSD: *M. capito*: (16 mos; 1200 fish feddan⁻¹) and *M. cephalus*; (8 mos; 500 fish feddan⁻¹).

***Nursery Age2: *M. capito* (28 mos; 2000 fish feddan⁻¹) and *M. cephalus*; (20 mos; 1000 fish feddan⁻¹).

****Relative total fish yield (RTFY) is reported in relation to the yield of nursery age1 at low stocking density.

Table (4): Physico-chemical parameters of water in different treated ponds of various *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* groups (LS means \pm SE) through 214 days polyculture period.

Treatment Parameters	Nursery Age1 (<i>M. capito</i> ; 16 mos and <i>M. cephalus</i> ; 8 mos)		Nursery Age2 (<i>M. capito</i> ; 28 mos and <i>M. cephalus</i> ; 20 mos)	
	LSD	HSD	LSD	HSD
DO (mg l ⁻¹)	6.06 \pm 0.21 ^{ab}	6.11 \pm 0.21 ^{ab}	6.49 \pm 0.21 ^a	5.57 \pm 0.21 ^b
Ammonia (mg l ⁻¹)	0.06 \pm 0.03	0.07 \pm 0.03	0.05 \pm 0.03	0.06 \pm 0.03
pH (mg l ⁻¹)	7.71 \pm 0.2	7.43 \pm 0.2	7.5 \pm 0.2	7.5 \pm 0.2
Transparency (cm)	16.71 \pm 1.07	14.43 \pm 1.07	15.43 \pm 1.07	13.43 \pm 1.07
Organic matter (mg l ⁻¹)	46.29 \pm 6.4	47.57 \pm 6.4	48.64 \pm 6.4	52.86 \pm 6.4
Total hardness (mg l ⁻¹)	31.57 \pm 3.41	29.57 \pm 3.41	24.43 \pm 3.41	25.71 \pm 3.41
Temperature	26.35 \pm 0.19	26.35 \pm 0.19	26.35 \pm 0.19	26.35 \pm 0.19
Total Phytoplankton (cells ml ⁻¹)	652.43 \pm 51.68	589.71 \pm 51.68	609.71 \pm 51.68	583.14 \pm 51.68
Total Zooplankton (animals l ⁻¹)	837.71 \pm 40.47 ^a	742.86 \pm 40.47 ^{ab}	717.86 \pm 40.47 ^b	720 \pm 40.47 ^b

* Means within the same raw with different superscripts are significantly different (P < 0.05).

4. DISCUSSION

In the wild, stunting in fish could be due to resource limitation arising from intraspecific density dependence (Ylikarjula et al., 1999). In aquaculture, stunting is related mainly to husbandry techniques (De Graaf et al., 1996). The Mullet species fingerlings in the present study obtained from a population nursed at high stocking conditions. This manipulation of space and food quality hindered growth and weight gains. Generally, advanced nursery (stunting) duration of *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* had yielded compensatory growth. Meanwhile, the elongation of nursery period had improved the growth pattern of both *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* as compared to their younger mates. Saleh (2006) revealed that *M. cephalus* can reach 750–1000g when polycultured with tilapia and carp in 7-8 months growing season after nursery phase (from August-November till April). He also added that if this population continued for another growing season they grow to 1500–1750 g. The relatively rapid growth in ponds exhibited by the stunted mullet presumed to be due to a larger rearing space

with higher food availability in the growout ponds hence accounting for growth compensation (Degraaf et al. 1996; Jobling and Koskela 1996; Nicieza and Metcalfe 1997; Ylikarjula et al.1999). Similarly, Biswas et al. (2017) conveyed higher net fish yield from periphyton- fertilized pond when *M. cephalus* L reared in brackishwater ponds. Also, stunted rohu and mrigal had attained higher compensatory growth rates than younger fish (Hossain et al., 2003).

In the meantime the influence of culture density was quite clear in this investigation; increasing culture density had decreased the growth rates of both *M. capito* and *M. cephalus*. However, increasing the nursery duration had relieved the density effect for both species when compared to their younger mates maintained at LSD. Rearing density is a fundamental element governing the production of any aquaculture species (Jobling, 1995; Yi et al. 1996; Hengsawat et al. 1997 and Maragoudaki et al., 1999). The space available and its full use under intensive culture conditions are critical for the farm profitability. Results of this study (Table 2 and 3)

demonstrated a direct relationship between stocking density and TFY (kg feddan⁻¹) and also NFY (kg feddan⁻¹). This is in accordance with several earlier studies that addressed positive yield-density relationships, (e.g. Delincé, 2013; Yi et al. 1996). However, the relationship between the fish yield and the number of stocked juveniles should be considered with regard to the preferred final weight both for the individual species and the total fish yield of both species.

Regarding the total yield of both species and irrespective of stocking density, the present study provided clear evidence of the advantage of polyculture of *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* as each species attained normal growth pattern. There was no interaction between cultured species as appeared by the growth increment maintained by both mullet species. This might be attributed to the feeding habit of each. *M. cephalus* boosted phytoplankton propagation through removing major consumers (zooplankton). Additionally, they stalwartly revised the benthic community, probably through direct consumption (Torrás *et al.*, 2000). A conclusion that was additionally confirmed by the different levels phytoplankton and zooplankton detected in this study (table 3). Similarly, Abdel-Hakim *et al.*, (2001) noted an improved performance of tilapia, mullet and eel when polycultured in earthen ponds compared with each species monoculture. Likewise, Ammar *et al.* (2008) reported higher growth performance and net returns when Nile tilapia (15000 feddan⁻¹) and *Mugil cephalus* (750 feddan⁻¹) polycultured together and fed extruded pellets.

The reordered survivals among the treatments were 94% to 97% and 95 % to 96% for *M. capito* and *M. cephalus* respectively. Similarly, cage culture of stunted mullet juveniles in the Nile cages stocked at appropriate density (8,000 fish cage⁻¹, 11.4 fish m⁻³) attained both high growth rate (0.83 g fish d⁻¹) and survival rate (99.0%) (Essa *et al.*, 2012). Also, the SR % detected in this experiment was much higher than the earlier (80%-95%) observed survivability in the *M. cephalus* high stocking monoculture (Bakeer *et al.*, 2008). However, it should be noted that the issue of stunted fingerlings or nursery duration was not clarified in the later study. Such levels were also higher than the range (75%–88%) reported in rohu from different studies of carp polyculture in India (Das *et al.*, 2004; Jena and Das, 2011; Sahu *et al.*, 2007). Das *et al.* (2016) described a positive correlation between juvenile stunting and growout survival existed and this wide range of survival to the differences in the nursery duration (non-stunted fry to highly stunted population). The longer nursery

(stunting) duration possibly steered a regular eradication of poor quality juveniles in the population, resulting in an increased grow-out phase survival.

No significant differences detected in total ammonia, transparency, organic matter, pH, total hardness and temperature the treatment ponds (Table 4). The DO levels were within the appropriate levels as defined by Boyd and Tucker (2012). Values of total ammonia ranged between 0.05 and 0.07 mg l⁻¹ and thus were lesser than the extreme concentration of TAN (1.0 mg l⁻¹) recommended in the earlier literature (Meade 2012; Lawson 1995; Ridha and Cruz 1998).

5. CONCLUSION

This study clarified that increasing space and food availability as compared to what is happening in the nursery ponds together with the nursery age (stunting) had synergistic effects in the subsequent culture period. Increasing levels of natural feed were complemented by the greater demand from larger, faster-growing fish as carrying capacity was increased. There was no interaction between cultured species as appeared by the growth increment maintained by both mullet species. Also, increasing the nursery duration (stunting) had relieved the density effect for both species when compared to their younger mates maintained at LSD. Management or profitability of polyculture depends on the fish species combinations, stocking rates, climate, pond fertility and market demand for fish; hence it can be concluded that for the stunted mullet species in this experiment, the availability of good-quality fry or juveniles together with the nursery age (stunting period), stocking density as well as the market size preferability would be the main concern.

6. REFERENCES

- Abdel-Hakim, N.F., Bakeer, M.N.Soltan, M.A 2001. Effect of dietary protein levels on growth performance and pond productivity of Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*), Eel (*Anguilla anguilla*) and Grey mullet (*Mugil cephalus*) reared in polyculture system. Egypt. J. Aquat. Biol.Fish. 5(4): 61-85.
- Abdel-Hakim, N.F., Al-Azab, A.A. El-Kholy, K.F., 2009. Effect of feeding regimes on growth performance of juvenile hybrid tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* × *Oreochromis aureus*). World J. Agric. Sci., 5 (1): 49-54.
- Ali, M., Nicieza, A. Wootton, R.J. 2003. Compensatory growth in fishes: a response to growth depression. Fish and fisheries, 4(2): 147-190.
- Ali, M.Z., Jauncey, K., 2004. Evaluation of mixed feeding schedules with respect to compensatory growth and body composition in African catfish *Clarias gariepinus*. Aquacult. Nutr. 10(1): 39-45.

- Ammar, A.A., Abd-Elgawad, A.S. and Salama, A.A. 2008. Effect of extruded and non-extruded fish pellet on growth performance and total production of Nile tilapia and grey mullet fingerlings reared in a polyculture system in earthen ponds. In 8th International Symposium on Tilapia in Aquaculture, Cairo, Egypt; p. 1199-209.
- APHA 2012. Standard methods for the examination of water and waste water. 22nd edn. American Public Health Association, New York, USA.
- Bakeer, M.N., Mostafa, M.A.A. Samra, I.M.A. 2008. Effect of *Mugil cephalus* size and density at initial stocking on growth performance and fish marketable size at harvest. J. Arab. Aquacult. Soc. 3: 16-32.
- Bishara, N.F., 1978. Fertilizing fish ponds: II—Growth of *Mugil cephalus* in Egypt by pond fertilization and feeding. Aquaculture, 13(4): 361-367.
- Biswas, G., Sundaray, J.K., Bhattacharyya, S.B., Anand, P.S., Ghoshal, T.K., De, D., Kumar, P., Sukumaran, K., Bera, A., Mandal, B. Kailasam, M. 2017. Influence of feeding, periphyton and compost application on the performances of striped grey mullet (*Mugil cephalus* L.) fingerlings in fertilized brackishwater ponds. Aquaculture, 481: 64-71.
- Boyd, C. E. Tucker C.S. 1992. Water quality and pond soil analysis for aquaculture. Alabama Agricultural Experiment Station. Auburn University. 183 pp.
- Boyd, C.E. and Tucker, C.S., 2012. Pond aquaculture water quality management. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Das, P.C., Ayyappan, S., Jena, J.K., Singh, S.K., Patamajhi, P. and Muduli, H.K., 2004. Effect of aeration on production and water quality changes in intensive carp culture. Indian J. Fish. 51(2): 173-183.
- Das, P.C., Mishra, S.S., Mishra, B. and Jayasankar, P., 2016. Influence of juvenile stunting on grow-out performance of rohu, *Labeo rohita* (Hamilton, 1822). J. Appl. Ichthyol. 32(5): 848-858.
- De Graaf, G., Galemoni, F. Banzoussi, B. 1996. Recruitment control of Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus*, by the African catfish, *Clarias gariepinus* (Burchell 1822), and the African snakehead, *Ophiocephalus obscurus*. I. A biological analysis. Aquaculture, 146(1-2): 85-100.
- De Silva, S.S. 1980. Biology of juvenile grey mullet: a short review. Aquaculture, 19(1): 21-36.
- Delincé, G. 2013. The ecology of the fish pond ecosystem: with special reference to Africa (Vol. 72). Springer Science & Business Media.
- Dickson, M., Nasr-Allah, A., Kenawy, D. Kruijssen, F. 2016. Increasing fish farm profitability through aquaculture best management practice training in Egypt. Aquaculture, 465, pp.172-178.
- El-Hawarry, W. 2006, 'Advanced studies on the reproduction and culture of some fresh water fish', PhD thesis, Alexandria University, Alexandria, ARE.
- El-Sayed, A. 2007. Analysis of feeds and fertilizers for sustainable aquaculture development in Egypt. FAO Fish. Techn. Pap. 497, p. 401.
- El-Sayed, A.F.M. 2017. Regional review on status and trends in aquaculture development in the near east and north Africa-2015. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Circular, (C1135/6), p.I.
- Essa, M.A., Omar, E.A., Srour, T.M., Helal, A.M. Elokaby, M.A. 2012. Effect of stocking density on growth performance, feed utilization, production and economic feasibility of thinlip grey mullet (*Liza ramada*) fingerlings, reared in floating net cages at the end of River Nile of Egypt. J. App. Agric. Res. 17: 105–121.
- FAO. 2016. Global aquaculture production dataset 1950–2014 (FishstatJ). Available at: www.fao.org/fishery/statistics/software/fishstatj/en
- Green, B.W., El Nagdy, Z. and Hebicha, H., 2002. Evaluation of Nile tilapia pond management strategies in Egypt. Aquacult. Res. 33(13): 1037-1048.
- Hayward, R.S., Noltie, D.B. Wang, N. 1997. Use of compensatory growth to double hybrid sunfish growth rates. Trans.Am. Fish. Soc. 126(2): 316-322.
- Hengsawat, K., Ward, F.J. Jaruratjamorn, P., 1997. The effect of stocking density on yield, growth and mortality of African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus* Burchell 1822) cultured in cages. Aquaculture, 152(1-4): 67-76.
- Hickling, C.F. 1970. A contribution to the natural history of the english grey mullets [Pisces, Mugilidae]. J. Mar. Biol. Assoc. U.K., 50(3): 609-633.
- Hossain, M.A., Little, D.C. Bhujel, R.C. 2003. Nursing duration and pond fertilization level affect polycultures of Indian major carp (rohu *Labeo rohita* and mrigal *Cirrhina mrigala*) with monosex Nile tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus*. Aquacul. Res. 34(9): 765-775.
- Huitema, B. 2011. The analysis of covariance and alternatives: Statistical methods for experiments, quasi-experiments, and single-case studies (Vol. 608). John Wiley & Sons.
- Jena, J. Das, P.C., 2011. Growout performance of Kuria labeo, *Labeo goniuis* (Hamilton), with major carps in carp polyculture system. Aquacul. Res. 42(9): 1332-1338.
- Jobling, M., 1994. Fish Bioenergetics Chapman and Hall London Google Scholar.
- Jobling, M. 1995. Feeding of charr in relation to aquaculture. Nord. J. Freshwat. Res. (Sweden). 71, pp. 102- 112.
- Jobling, M. Koskela, J. 1996. Interindividual variations in feeding and growth in rainbow trout during restricted feeding and in a subsequent period of compensatory growth. J. Fish Biol. 49(4): 658-667.
- Lawson, T. B. 1995. Fundamentals of aquaculture engineering. Chapman and Hall, New York.
- Lin, C.K., Teichert-Coddington, D.R., Green, B.W. Veverica K L., 1997. Fertilization regimes. In: H.S. Egna and K.L. Boyd (Editors), Dynamic of pond aquaculture (pp. 73-107). CRCP Press, Boca Raton/ New York.
- Little, D.C., Bhujel, R.C. Pham, T.A., 2003. Advanced nursing of mixed-sex and mono-sex tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) fry, and its impact on

- subsequent growth in fertilized ponds. *Aquaculture*, 221(1-4): 265-276.
- Maragoudaki, D., Paspatis, M. Kentouri, M., 1999. Influence of stocking density on growth of juvenile red porgy *Pagrus pagrus* L. under different feeding conditions. *Aquacult. Res.* 30 (7): 501-508.
- McKinnon, A.D., Trott, L.A., Alongi, D.M. Davidson, A., 2002. Water column production and nutrient characteristics in mangrove creeks receiving shrimp farm effluent. *Aquacult. Res.* 33 (1): 55-73.
- Meade, J.W. 2012. *Aquaculture management*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Nicieza, A.G., Metcalfe, N.B., 1997. Growth compensation in juvenile Atlantic salmon: responses to depressed temperature and food availability. *Ecology*, 78(8): 2385-2400.
- Pickering, A. D. 1981. The concept of biological stress. In A. D. Pickering (Ed.), *Stress and fish* (pp. 1–9). London, UK: Academic Press.
- Ridha, M.T., Cruz, E.M., Al- Ameer, A.A. and Al-Ahmed, A.A. 1998. Effects of controlling temperature and light duration on seed production in tilapia, *Oreochromis spilurus* (Günther). *Aquacult. Res.* 29(6): 403-410.
- Sadek, S. D. Mires 2000. Capture of wild finfish fry in Mediterranean coastal areas and possible impact on aquaculture development and marine genetic resources. *Isr. J. Aquacult./Bamidgeh*, 52(2): 77–88 (2000).
- Sadek, S. 2015. Culture of Mugilidae in Egypt. *Biology, ecology and culture of grey mullets (Mugilidae)*: 501-513.
- Sadek, S. 2016. Culture of Mugilidae in Egypt. *Biology, Ecology and Culture of Grey Mulletts (Mugilidae)*, 1841719133, pp.501-513.
- Saleh, M.A., 2006. *Cultured Aquatic Species Information Programme–Mugil cephalus* In: FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department. Rome.
- Saleh, M. 2008. Capture-based aquaculture of mullets in Egypt. In: (Lovatelli, A., and P. F. Holthus, Eds) *Capture-based aquaculture. Global overview*. FAO Fish. Tech. Pap. 508: 109–126.
- Sahu, P.K., Jena, J.K., Das, P.C., Mondal, S. Das, R. 2007. Production performance of *Labeo calbasu* (Hamilton) in polyculture with three Indian major carps *Catla catla* (Hamilton), *Labeo rohita* (Hamilton) and *Cirrhinus mrigala* (Hamilton) with provision of fertilizers, feed and periphytic substrate as varied inputs. *Aquaculture*, 262(2-4): 333-339.
- Santiago, C.B., Gonzal, A.C., Aralar, E.V. Arcilla, R.P., 2004. Effect of stunting of juvenile bighead carp *Aristichthys nobilis* (Richardson) on compensatory growth and reproduction. *Aquacult. Res.* 35(9): 836-841.
- SAS. 2004. *Statistical analysis system. SAS. User's Guide SAS Incorporation Institute*.
- Torras, X., Cardona, L. Gisbert, E. 2000. Cascading effects of the flathead grey mullet *Mugil cephalus* in freshwater eutrophic microcosmos. *Hydrobiologia*, 429(1-3): 49-57.
- Wedemeyer, G.A. 1997. Effects of rearing conditions on the health and physiological quality of fish in intensive culture. In G. K. Iwama, A. D. Pickering, J. P. Sumpter & C. B. Schreck (Eds.), *Fish stress and health in aquaculture* (pp. 35–71). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wedemeyer, G.A. and McLeay, D., 1981. Methods for determining the tolerance of fishes to environmental stressors. In A. D. Pickering (Ed.), *Stress and fish* (pp. 247–275). London, UK: Academic Press.
- Wootton, R.J. 1998. *Ecology of teleost fishes*. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht. 386 pp.
- Yi, Y., Lin, C.K. Diana, J.S. 1996. Influence of Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) stocking density in cages on their growth and yield in cages and in ponds containing the cages. *Aquaculture*, 146(3-4): 205-215.
- Ylikarjula, J., Heino, M. Dieckmann, U. 1999. Ecology and adaptation of stunted growth in fish. *Evol. Ecol.* 13 (5): 433-453.
- Zimmermann, S., Nair, C.M. New, M.B. 2010. Grow-out systems–polyculture and integrated culture. *Freshwater prawns: biology and farming*, pp.195-217.