CORRELATION BETWEEN MOCA AND MMSE FOR THE ASSESSMENT OF COGNITION IN SCHIZOPHRENIA

Saida Fisekovic, Amra Memic, Alma Pasalic
Psychiatric Clinic, Clinical Center University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina

Corresponding author: Prof. Saida Fisekovic, MD, PhD. Psychiatric Clinic, Clinical Center University of Sarajevo. Bolnicka 25. 71000 Sarajevo. Bosnia and Herzegovina. e-mail: saida_fisekovic@yahoo.com

1. INTRODUCTION

Schizophrenia is a complex neurodevelopmental disorder with impairment of cognitive function as a central feature, which is confirmed by a number of studies performed on patients who suffer from Sch, where clinical symptoms and social functioning of patients are consequences of neurocognitive deficits. The cognitive deficit is core aspect of the schizophrenic illness (1, 2). Traditionally, significant cognitive impairment was thought to be evident only in elderly deteriorated patient with schizophrenia. Significant cognitive impairment is common in schizophrenia, affecting up to 75% of patients (3). Only 27% of the patients with schizophrenia were classified as neuropsychopathologically “normal”. This indicates that significant cognitive impairment in schizophrenia is, in fact, the norm. The pathophysiology underlying the cognitive deficits often associated with schizophrenia may be distinct from that causing some of the core clinical features (3). In general, the strongest voices to emerge have been those that claim a disproportionate impairment of memory functioning (4, 5). The cognitive impairment often pre-dates the illness onset. A wide range of cognitive functions are affected, particularly memory, attention, motor skills, executive function and intelligence. Cognitive impairment is related to social and functional outcome (3).

Cognitive impairment in operational memory, declarative memory and attention are the basic symptoms of schizophrenia that contribute to heterogeneity in the phenomenological expression of symptoms and influence on the complexity, diversity course and outcome of the disease. Schizophrenia is a chronic disorder involving approximately 1% of the general population. Prefrontal cortex plays a dominant role in the psychic life of humans, because it integrates information coming directly from the limbic regions, neocortex, brainstem and hypothalamus and indirectly via the thalamus from almost all regions of the brain, so dysfunctional, that certain structural and/or functional changes in this part of the CNS leading to quantitative and qualitative disorders of consciousness, planning, actions implementation, the quantitative and qualitative disorders of vision, concentration, speech, emotion and affect (6). As a group, people with schizophrenia have lower achievements on a wide range of cognitive tests, especially those relating to regulation of the frontal lobe such as attention, the use of strategies and problem solving (7). Numerous scientific studies show that the variance of neurocognitive deficits in schizophrenic patients is between 20-60% and in numerous studies, is closely related to the outcome of the symptoms. Schizophrenia is a chronic mental illness that leads to a high degree of impairment in relation to other psychiatric disor-
Correlation Between MoCA and MMSE For the Assessment of Cognition in Schizophrenia

2. GOALS

The goals of our study were:

To compare the psychometric properties of two instruments and the characteristics of applications that may be relevant for the clinical application of these instruments.

To examine and compare the degree of cognitive impairment in specific cognitive domains (working memory, declarative memory and/or attention) in patients suffering from schizophrenia using MoCA and the MMSE alone.

Comparison of the degree of sensitivity of the applied instruments (MMSE and MoCA).

3. MATERIAL AND METHODS

The study included inpatients (n=30) who suffered from Schizophrenia (Sch) diagnosed according to tenth revision of the International classification of diseases (ICD-10), treated at the Psychiatric Clinic, Clinical Centre University of Sarajevo (CCUS). The patients were followed during 2010. The study was, for the most part, conducted as a prospective method of clinical research and partly as a descriptive controlled study. The patients were treated with typical antipsychotics (haloperidol and chlorpromazine) (n=15) and atypical antipsychotics (olanzapine, risperidone and clozapine) (n=15).

To test the statistical significance of observed differences between groups used one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA), while testing the interconnection of the observed variables used Spearman's correlation coefficient, with significance level of p<0.05 is considered statistically significant.

Instruments

We used MoCA (Montreal Cognitive Assessment Test) and MMSE (Mini Mental State Examination) for the assessment of cognitive deficits.

The MoCA is relatively new cognitive screening test takes 10 to 12 minutes to administer. The Montreal Cognitive Assessment (MoCA) is more sensitive to subtle cognitive deficits in patients with Parkinson's disease, but in schizophrenia, compared with the conventional Mini-Mental Status Examination (MMSE). The MMSE is the most commonly used screening instrument to detect cognitive dysfunction in schizophrenic patients. Both tests are scored from 0 to 30, with lower scores representing cognitive dysfunction.

4. RESULTS

In the study we included 30 patients diagnosed with schizophrenia, where the age of onset of illness ranged from 17-45 years and the average age of disease onset was 24 years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>15 (50.0%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>15 (50.0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>32.3±7.1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>18-47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mental status</th>
<th>Married</th>
<th>7 (23.3%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>17 (56.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>6 (20.0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment</th>
<th>Employed</th>
<th>7 (23.3%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>18 (60.0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>5 (16.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age of disease onset</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>24.4±6.7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>17-45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education level</th>
<th>8 years</th>
<th>8 (26.7%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14 years</td>
<td>15 (50.0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>5 (16.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 or more yrs</td>
<td>2 (6.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tobacco smoking</th>
<th>Smoker</th>
<th>25 (83.3%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non smoker</td>
<td>5 (16.7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Demographic data

Table 2. Basic data on disease
Demographic data showed that number of unemployment was 60%, which indicate the high degree of work incapacity cause by early disease onset (hebephrenic schizophrenia 56.7%), compared to the level of education, with domination of the secondary school education (59%).

Average scores on the MoCA scale were 19.9±5.1, corresponding to moderate to severe cognitive impairment, while scores on the MMSE scale was 24.9±3.3, corresponding to the result of mild cognitive impairment.

14 patients (77.8%) of those who on MMSE scale had a score greater or equal to 26 (normal range) and the MoCA scale had a normal score (>24), while 2 or 22.2% of patients reported moderate to severe cognitive disability. Analysis of the correlation coefficient between the total score of MoCA and MMSE scale indicates a statistically significant positive correlation with Pearson rho=0.403 and p=0.027 (p<0.05). Sensitivity was 41.7%, specificity = 66.7%, PPV = 83.3%, NPV = 22.2%.

If we make a comparison MoCA scale according to the MMSE according to cut-off values then we find that there were 10 true positive, true negative 4, 14 false positive and 2 false negative. This all leads to sensitivity of MoCA scale, again in comparison with the MMSE of 41.7%, specificity 66.7%, positive predictive value of 83.3% and negative predictive value of 22.2% which indicates that the scale is really good at detecting true positive but have poor performance in the exclusion of false negative findings.

5. DISCUSSION

The published results of a small number of clinical studies assess the severity of cognitive deficits in schizophrenic patients.

In our clinical study all patients (n=30) underwent the following testing: MoCA and MMSE. The mean MoCA score was, consistent with moderate to severe cognitive impairment (10). Average scores on the MoCA scale were 19.9±5.1, corresponding to moderate to severe cognitive impairment, while scores on the MMSE scale was 24.9±3.3, corresponding to the result of mild cognitive impairment.

These results are in agreement with the results of Preda et al. for MoCA but not for the MMSE scale, which states. The mean MoCA score was 20±4.7, consistent with moderate to severe cognitive impairment. In contrast, the mean MMSE score was 27.2±2, which is within the normal to mild MCI cognition score range. Twenty-one patients (84%) of those who scored > or = 26 (normal range) on the MMSE had a MoCA score >26 (MCI range). Twenty-three (85%) of those who scored >or = 24 on the MMSE (MCI range) had a MoCA score <24 (moderate to severe cognitive impairment). 14 patients (77.8%) of those on the MMSE scale had a score > or = 26 (normal range) also at MoCA scale had a normal score (>24), while in 2 or 22.2% of patients was reported moderate to severe cognitive disability. These findings are in contrast with the findings of Preda et al, where twenty-one patients (84%) of those who scored >or = 26 (normal range) on the MMSE had a MoCA score <26 (MCI range). Twenty-three (85%) of those who scored >or = 24 on the MMSE (MCI range) had a MoCA score >24 (moderate to severe cognitive impairment).

Analysis of the correlation coefficient between the total score of MoCA and the MMSE scale indicates a statistically significant positive correlation with Pearson rho=0.403 and p=0.027 (p<0.05), but this study did not analyze individual subscales as stated in research by Preda et al. and it is difficult to compare with their findings. What arises was 27.2±2, which is within the normal to mild MCI cognition score range.

Table 3. Comparison MMSE : MoCA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X</th>
<th>MINI–MENTAL STATE EXAMINATION</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SEM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MoCA</td>
<td>MONTREALSKA LIJESTVICA KOGNITIVNE PROCEJENE</td>
<td>19.8667</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5.09045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. MINI–MENTAL STATE EXAMINATION * MoCA. Chi-square=0.139; p=0.545

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MoCA</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>&lt;24</th>
<th>&gt;24</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MMSE</td>
<td>&lt;26</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;26</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>40.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Comparison MMSE : MoCA

Figure 2. MINI–MENTAL STATE EXAMINATION * MoCA

Figure 3. MINI–MENTAL STATE EXAMINATION * MoCA

Table 5. Comparison MMSE : MoCA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>X</th>
<th>MINI–MENTAL STATE EXAMINATION</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SEM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MoCA</td>
<td>MONTREALSKA LIJESTVICA KOGNITIVNE PROCEJENE</td>
<td>19.8667</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5.09045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
validity of cognitive assessment of vari-
ous researchers have suggested a re-
cent exploration of the proposal to
apply a generalized deficit in order
to determine whether multiple per-
formance deficits in schizophrenia
are the result of common underly-
ing processes (12).

6. CONCLUSION
There is considerable difficulty
is comparison of reliably for assess-
ment scales. To date there are no val-
iddated brief screening instruments
for the diagnosis and assessment of
severity of schizophrenia cognitive
deficits. The MoCA has higher sen-
sitivity and specificity to detect cog-
nitive impairment than the MMSE.
The MoCA is an easy to adminster,
useful screening tool for the assess-
ment of cognitive deficits associat-
ed with schizophrenia. Our prelimi-
ary results also suggest that the
MoCA might be a sensitive test for
the assessment of some of the core
cognitive deficits in schizophrenia
such as speeded attention and ex-
cective functioning. Further stud-
ies validating MoCA against stan-
dard neurocognitive testing batter-
ies are recommended. However, it
had been established that the MMSE
is not well suited for mild cognitive
impairment, which raises the ques-
tion whether it is an adequate “stan-
dard” to compare performance with
the MoCA.

REFERENCES
1. Goldberg TE, Weinberger DR, Ber-
man KF, Pliskin NH, Podd MH. Further evidence for dementia of the
prefrontal type in schizophre-
nia: A controlled study to teaching
the Wisconsin Card Sorting Test.
Arch Gen Psychiatry. 1987; 44(11):
1008-1014.
2. Shallice T, Burgess PW, Frith CD.
Can the neuropsychological case-
study approach be applied to schizophrenia? Psychol Med. 1991;
21(3): 664-673.
3. O’Carroll R. Cognitive impair-
ment in schizophrenia. Advance in
Psychiatric Treatment 2000; 6: 161-
168.
4. McKanna PJ. Memory, knowledge
and delusions. British Journal of
5. Saykin AJ, Shtasel DL, Gur RE.
et al. Neuropsychological deficits
in neuroleptic naive patients with
first-episode schizophrenia. Ar-
chives of General Psychiatry. 1994;
6. Lencz T, Smith CW, McAulhlin
D, Author A, Nakayama E, Howey
L., Cornblatt BA. Generalized and
specific neurocognitive deficits in
prodromal schizophrenia. Biol Psy-
chiatry, 2006; 59: 863-871.
7. Goldman RS, Axelrod BN, Taylor
SF. Neuropsychological aspects of
schizophrenia. In: I Grant & K.M.
Adams (Eds.), Neuropsychological
assessment of neuropsychiatric dis-
orders 82nd ed.). New York: Oxford
University Press, 1996.
8. Kurtz MM, Wexler BE, Fujimoto
M, Shagan DS, Seltzer JC. Sympt-
toms versus neurocognition as pre-
dictors of change in life skills in
schizophrenia after outpatient re-
habilitation. Schizophr Res. 2008;
102(1-3): 303-311.
V, Collin I, Cummings JL, Chertkow H. The Montreal Cogni-
tive Assessment (MoCA): A Brief
Screening Tool For Mild Cognitive
Impairment. Journal of the Amer-
ican Geriatrics Society. 2005; 53:
695-699.
10. Smith T. et al. The Montreal Cogni-
tive Assessment: validity and util-
ity in a memory clinic setting. Can
J Psychiatry, 2007 May; 52(5): 329-
332.
instrument for the assessment of
cognition in schizophrenia. In Ab-
stracts from the 13th Internation-
al Congress on Schizophrenia Re-
search, Schizophrenia Bulletin.
2011; 37(S1): 225-226.
12. Knight R A, Silverstein SM. The
role of cognitive psychology in
guiding research on cognitive defi-
cits in schizophrenia. In M. F. Len-
zenweger & R. H. Dworkin (Eds.),
Origins and development of schizo-
phrenia: Advances in experimental